ADAPTATION ACTION AREAS IN FLORIDA

THE STATE OF PLAY

THOMAS T. ANKERSEN, LEGAL SKILLS PROFESSOR AND DIRECTOR
BRANDON POWNALL, STUDENT ASSOCIATE AND J.D. CANDIDATE
ALEXA MENASHE, J.D. CANDIDATE
INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW

- Florida’s Adaptation Action Area (AAA) law: What is says; What it does
- Methods
- Policy history
- Spatial Explicitness
- Themes
- Conclusions
WHAT IT SAYS AND WHAT IT DOES

At the option of the local government, develop an adaptation action area designation for those low-lying coastal zones that are experiencing coastal flooding due to extreme high tides and storm surge and are vulnerable to the impacts of rising sea level.

...areas including, but not limited to, those areas for which the land elevations are below, at, or near mean higher high water, which have a hydrologic connection to coastal waters, or which are designated as evacuation zones for storm surge.”


Home Rule – LG’s likely not preempted from using their own tools

Upon this optional designation, funding and other resources for improved infrastructure and planning within the AAA can be prioritized.

POLICY HISTORY

- South Florida Climate Compact 2010 federal legislative agenda – federally designated regional AAA
  - Compact counties would serve as a federal pilot project endorsed by Florida legislature
  - Federal funds would flow
- Proposed complementary state legislation that would provide technical assistance and funding for local governments to review and revise their comprehensive plans and LDRs to incorporate climate change mitigation and adaptation planning strategies.
- Federal effort failed but the policy construct found its way into Florida law
COASTAL COMMUNITIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOCAL GOVT</th>
<th>COUNT</th>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>RPC</th>
<th>WMD</th>
<th>DOT_DIST</th>
<th>CME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANNA MARIA</td>
<td>MANATEE</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APALACHICOLA</td>
<td>FRANKLIN</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>Apalachees</td>
<td>Northwest Flo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATLANTIC BCH</td>
<td>DUVAL</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>North East Fl</td>
<td>St Johns River</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAL HARBOUR</td>
<td>MIAMI-DA</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAY CO</td>
<td>BAY</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>Emerald Con</td>
<td>Northwest Flo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAY HARBOR IS</td>
<td>MIAMI-DA</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BELLEAIR</td>
<td>PINELLAS</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BELLEAIR BCH</td>
<td>PINELLAS</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BELLEAIR BLUFFS</td>
<td>PINELLAS</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BELLEAIR SH</td>
<td>PINELLAS</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEVERLY BCH</td>
<td>FLAGLER</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>North East Fl</td>
<td>St Johns River</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOCA RATON</td>
<td>PALM BEA</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>Treasure Cco</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BONTIA SPRGS</td>
<td>LEE</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Southwest Fl</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOYNTON BCH</td>
<td>PALM BEA</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>Treasure Cco</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRADENTON</td>
<td>MANATEE</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRADENTON BCH</td>
<td>MANATEE</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Tampa Bay</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BREVARD CO</td>
<td>BREVARD</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>East Central</td>
<td>St Johns River</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRINVY BREEZES</td>
<td>PALM BEA</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>Treasure Cco</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROWARD CO</td>
<td>BROVAR</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALLAWAY</td>
<td>BAY</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>Emerald Con</td>
<td>Northwest Flo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPE CANAVERAL</td>
<td>BREVARD</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>East Central</td>
<td>St Johns River</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPE CORAL</td>
<td>LEE</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Southwest Fl</td>
<td>South Florida</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARRABELLE</td>
<td>FRANKLIN</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>Apalachees</td>
<td>Northwest Flo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAR KEY</td>
<td>LEVY</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>North Centre</td>
<td>Streammas Rs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHARLOTTE CO</td>
<td>CHARLOT</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Southwest Fl</td>
<td>Southwest Flo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CINCO RAYOUI</td>
<td>OKALOON</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>Pinellas Cco</td>
<td>Northwest Flo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

METHODS

- Global Municode search
- Systematic review of local government websites
- Develop spreadsheet / adoption timeline
- Analysis
  - Aspirational v. Operational distinction
  - Thematic variation (built environment, natural resources, social equity)
  - Policy approach (regulatory, project-based)
• CPA was enacted in 2011
• 25 coastal municipalities and counties have amended their comprehensive plans AAA since Fernandina Beach became the first
• Skewed distribution toward South Florida and the Compact governments
• Absence of Big Bend Panhandle communities
ASPIRATION & OPERATIONAL

AAA amendment language is written in two categories: *aspirational* and *operational*.

Aspirational refers to adoption language that calls for, but does yet not create, a spatially explicit AAA.

Operational refers to adoption language, or post-adoption actions, that creates a spatially explicit adaptation planning area.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspirational Language</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Operational Language</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boynton Beach</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Broward County</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clearwater</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Fort Lauderdale</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fernandina Beach</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Indian River County</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jupiter</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Jacksonville</td>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key West</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Miami-Dade County*</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Satellite Beach</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miami</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Vero Beach</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miami-Dade County*</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Village of Pinecrest</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe County</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Yankeetown</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nassau County</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Miami</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palm Beach County</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pompano Beach</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarasota City</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarasota County</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tequesta</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titusville</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Operational resolution adopted, but not yet included in Comp plan.
REGIONAL & MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL

- AAA Construct well-suited to collaborative multi-jurisdictional planning.
- Currently only 2 examples:
  - Broward County
    - Creates AAA’s of “regional significance”
      - Sand Bypass Project
      - Project specific but regionally significant
  - Miami-Dade County
    - Arch Creek AAA
    - Incorporates 5 jurisdictions

BROWARD COUNTY LAND USE PLAN
of the Broward County Comprehensive Plan
SPATIAL EXPLICITNESS

Adaptation Action Areas have been spatially defined by:

- **Coastal High Hazard Area** (E.g. Jacksonville)
  - Note that thus far these are based on current and not future conditions with SLR
- **Storm surge** (Vero Beach – Cat 1 or Cat 2)
- **Drainage basins** (Miami Dade Arch Creek AAA)
- **SLR projections** (Satellite Beach Inland Flooding AAA)
- **Local conditions**
  - Seaward of A-1-A (Satellite Beach erosion AAA)
  - Drainage improvements & Sea wall upgrades (Ft. Lauderdale AAA)
AAA policy language primarily focuses on the built environment, the natural environment, or both

**Built**
Focuses on “grey” infrastructure
Ft. Lauderdale’s sixteen AAAs
- (for the most part) created with the intention to protect infrastructure from flooding

**Natural**
Focuses on “green” infrastructure
Yankeetown focused its AAA almost exclusively on the natural environment:
- maintenance of freshwater flows to slow saltwater intrusion,
- beneficial use of dredged spoil to maintain pocket beaches and salt marsh elevation, and
- rolling buffers and to promote habitat migration as sea levels rise.
SOCIAL EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS

- Social equity emerging as a theme but underperforming
- Concerning because can lead to neglect by default.
  - E.g. spatially defining and prioritizing one area can lead to neglect of another
- Bright spot -- Specifically addressed in Miami Dade County’s Arch Creek AAA
  - Mix of income levels with both subsidized and native affordable housing
High rates of poverty

**ULI Equity Recommendations**

- Consider swapping vulnerable properties with county-owned foreclosures on higher ground
- Use county HOME funds for voluntary relocations
- Enable interested homeowners to pursue voluntary buy-outs for properties in Arch Creek Estates
- Create a community land trust or partner with existing organization to preserve open space
ADAPTATION ACTIONS

Adaptation actions take two primary forms

• enhanced regulatory scrutiny and/or
• capital improvement projects

Enhanced regulation functions much like a traditional overlay zone in land use law (e.g. zone-specific stricter standards sit on top of jurisdiction-wide standards)

Nassau County explicitly characterizes its AAA as an overlay and offers several examples of stricter regulation to accomplish its objectives.

Satellite Beach amended its LDR’s to prohibit second setback variance to “promote a managed retreat from the sensitive ocean bluff and erosion adaptation action areas”
PRIORITIZED FUNDING

- Setting funding priorities is an explicit goal of the 2011 AAA legislation
- Served as the historical impetus for pursuing the concept at the federal level by the Climate Compact
- Capital Improvements element of the comprehensive plan
- Ft. Lauderdale AAA’s are the poster children
  - Identified capital Improvements (drainage/sea walls)
  - Included in the community investment plan
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

• Our review suggests that sea level rise has now been “baked in” to many if not most coastal local government comprehensive plans

• With a few exceptions, the AAA policy tool has yet to operationalized in a meaningful way (e.g. through regulation or funding prioritization)

• Local government AAA’s continue to rely on present-day planning boundaries without regard to the future condition (e.g. the CHHA of today and not the CHHA of the future).

• With a few exceptions, AAA’s emphasize policies that address the built environment and natural resources, with less attention to social equity.
  • Prioritizing AAAs that don’t account for social equity can lead to resources being shifted away from social equity considerations

• The State should move beyond AAA planning grants to more substantial resources for adaptation-based capital improvements and other adaptation policies within AAA’s (e.g. buy-outs)

• Local governments should begin experimenting with spatially explicit revenue-generating policy tools within AAAs (e.g. special assessments, tax increment financing, etc.).